

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

STATE OF CALIFORNIA, et al.

Plaintiffs,

v.

WILBUR L. ROSS, et al.,

Defendants.

-----  
CITY OF SAN JOSE, et al.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

WILBUR L. ROSS, et al.,

Defendants.

Case No. 18-cv-01865-RS

18-cv-02279-RS

**[PROPOSED] FINAL JUDGMENT,  
ORDER OF VACATUR, AND  
PERMANENT INJUNCTION**

In accordance with the Court's Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law, dated March 6, 2019, and Rule 58(b)(2)(B) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, it is ORDERED, ADJUDGED, and DECREED as follows:

**FINAL JUDGMENT**

Final judgment is entered for Plaintiffs and against Defendants on Plaintiffs' claims arising under the Enumeration Clause and the Fourteenth Amendment (the First Cause of Action in the Complaints in each of No. 18-cv-1865 and No. 18-cv-2279).

Final judgment is entered for Defendants and against Plaintiffs the City of San Jose and Black Alliance for Just Immigration (the "San Jose Plaintiffs") on the San Jose Plaintiffs' claim arising under the Apportionment Clause (the Second Cause of Action in the Complaint in No. 18-cv-2279).

Final judgment is entered for Plaintiffs and against Defendants on Plaintiffs' claims arising under the Administrative Procedure Act (the Second Cause of Action in the Complaint in No. 18-cv-1865 and the Third and Fourth Causes of Action in No. 18-cv-2279).

**VACATUR AND REMAND**

Secretary Ross's March 26, 2018 decision to include the citizenship question on the 2020 Census is VACATED and the matter is REMANDED to the Department of Commerce.

**PERMANENT INJUNCTION**

In accordance with the above judgment in favor of Plaintiffs on their claims arising under the Administrative Procedure Act, Defendants, including the Secretary of Commerce in his official capacity, the Director of the Census in his official capacity, and any successors to those offices, together with their agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and other persons who are in active concert or participation with the foregoing, *see* Fed. R. Civ. P. 65(d)(2), are PERMANENTLY ENJOINED from including the citizenship question on the 2020 Census unless:

- (1) Defendants establish that direct inquiries regarding citizenship are necessary given the "kind, timeliness, quality and scope of the statistics required" and that administrative records will not suffice, 13 U.S.C. § 6(c);
- (2) Defendants identify new circumstances that necessitate the last minute addition of the citizenship question to the census, *id.* § 141(f)(3); and
- (3) Secretary Ross considers all relevant factors and evidence, and sets forth the actual

1 basis for his decision.

2 In addition, in accordance with the above judgment in favor of Plaintiffs on their claims  
3 arising under the Enumeration Clause, Defendants, including the Secretary of Commerce in his  
4 official capacity, the Director of the Census in his official capacity, and any successors to those  
5 offices, together with their agents, servants, employees, attorneys, and other persons who are in  
6 active concert or participation with the foregoing, *see* Fed. R. Civ. P. 65(d)(2), are  
7 PERMANENTLY ENJOINED from including the citizenship question on the 2020 Census,  
8 regardless of any technical compliance with the Administrative Procedure Act.

9  
10 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

11  
12 Dated: March\_\_\_\_\_, 2019

13  
14 \_\_\_\_\_  
15 RICHARD SEEBORG  
16 United States District Judge

17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
CASE NOS. 18-cv-01865-RS, 18-cv-02279-RS

1 REVIEWED AND APPROVED AS TO FORM:

2 Dated: March 12, 2019

Respectfully Submitted,

3  
4 XAVIER BECERRA  
Attorney General of California  
5 MARK R. BECKINGTON  
ANTHONY R. HAKL  
6 Supervising Deputy Attorneys General  
GABRIELLE D. BOUTIN  
7 ANNA T. FERRARI  
TODD GRABARSKY  
8 NOREEN P. SKELLY  
Deputy Attorneys General

9 /s/ R. Matthew Wise  
10 R. MATTHEW WISE  
Deputy Attorney General  
11 *Attorneys for Plaintiff State of California, by and  
through Attorney General Xavier Becerra*

12 Dated: March 12, 2019

13 /s/ Charles L. Coleman  
CHARLES L. COLEMAN III, SBN 65496  
14 DAVID I. HOLTZMAN  
HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP  
15 50 California Street, 28<sup>th</sup> Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
16 Telephone: (415) 743-6970  
Fax: (415) 743-6910  
17 Email: charles.coleman@hklaw.com  
18 *Attorneys for Plaintiff County of Los Angeles*

19 Dated: March 12, 2019

20 MIKE FEUER  
City Attorney for the City of Los Angeles

21 /s/ Valerie Flores  
VALERIE FLORES, SBN 138572  
22 Managing Senior Assistant City Attorney  
200 North Main Street, 7th Floor, MS 140  
23 Los Angeles, CA 90012  
Telephone: (213) 978-8130  
24 Fax: (213) 978-8222  
Email: Valerie.Flores@lacity.org

1 Dated: March 12, 2019

HARVEY LEVINE  
City Attorney for the City of Fremont

2  
3 /s/ Harvey Levine  
SBN 61880  
3300 Capitol Ave.  
Fremont, CA 94538  
Telephone: (510) 284-4030  
Fax: (510) 284-4031  
Email: hlevine@fremont.gov

7 Dated: March 12, 2019

CHARLES PARKIN  
City Attorney for the City of Long Beach

9 /s/ Charles Parkin  
SBN 159162  
333 W. Ocean Blvd., 11th Floor  
Long Beach CA, 90802  
Telephone: (562) 570-2200  
Fax: (562) 436-1579  
Email: Charles.Parkin@longbeach.gov

13 Dated: March 12, 2019

BARBARA J. PARKER  
City Attorney for the City of Oakland

15 /s/ Erin Bernstein  
MARIA BEE  
Chief Assistant City Attorney  
ERIN BERNSTEIN, SBN 231539  
Supervising Deputy City Attorney  
MALIA MCPHERSON  
Deputy City Attorney  
City Hall, 6th Floor  
1 Frank Ogawa Plaza  
Oakland, California 94612  
Telephone: (510) 238-3601  
Fax: (510) 238-6500  
Email: ebernstein@oaklandcityattorney.org

22 Dated: March 12, 2019

JOHN LUEBBERKE  
City Attorney for the City of Stockton

24 /s/ John Luebberke  
SBN 164893  
425 N. El Dorado Street, 2nd Floor  
Stockton, CA 95202  
Telephone: (209) 937-8333  
Fax: (209) 937-8898  
Email: John.Luebberke@stocktonca.gov

1 Dated: March 12, 2019

DANNIS WOLIVER KELLEY  
SUE ANN SALMON EVANS  
KEITH A. YEOMANS

3 /s/ Keith A. Yeomans

4 Keith A. Yeomans

5 *Attorneys for Plaintiff-Intervenor  
Los Angeles Unified School District*

6 Dated: March 12, 2019

**MANATT, PHELPS & PHILLIPS, LLP**

7 By: s/ Andrew Case

8 John F. Libby

John W. McGuinness

Emil Petrossian

9 Andrew Case (*pro hac vice*)

Ana Guardado

10 11355 West Olympic Boulevard

11 Los Angeles, California 90064

12 Telephone: (310) 312-4000

Facsimile: (310) 312-4224

13 **LAWYERS' COMMITTEE FOR CIVIL  
RIGHTS UNDER LAW**

14 Kristen Clarke

Jon M. Greenbaum

15 Ezra D. Rosenberg

Dorian L. Spence

16 1500 K Street NW, Suite 900

Washington, DC 20005

17 Telephone: (202) 662-8600

18 Facsimile: (202) 783-0857

19 **PUBLIC COUNSEL**

Mark Rosenbaum

610 South Ardmore Avenue

20 Los Angeles, California 90005

21 Telephone: (213) 385-2977

Facsimile: (213) 385-9089

22 **CITY OF SAN JOSE**

Richard Doyle, City Attorney

23 Nora Frimann, Assistant City Attorney

Office of the City Attorney

24 200 East Santa Clara Street, 16th Floor

San José, California 95113-1905

25 Telephone Number: (408) 535-1900

26 Facsimile Number: (408) 998-3131

E-Mail: cao.main@sanjoseca.gov

27 *Attorneys for Plaintiffs*

28 **CITY OF SAN JOSE and BLACK ALLIANCE  
FOR JUST IMMIGRATION**

1  
2 Dated: March 12, 2019

JOSEPH H. HUNT  
Assistant Attorney General

3  
4 BRETT A. SHUMATE  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General

5 CARLOTTA P. WELLS  
Assistant Branch Director

6  
7 MARSHA S. EDNEY  
Senior Trial Counsel

8 /s/ Carlotta P. Wells  
KATE BAILEY  
9 STEPHEN EHRLICH  
10 CAROL FEDERIGHI  
DANIEL HALAINEN  
Trial Attorneys  
United States Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
11 1100 L Street NW  
12 Washington, DC 20530  
13 Phone: (202) 514-923  
14 Email: kate.bailey@usdoj.gov  
*Attorneys for Defendants*

15  
16 **FILER'S ATTESTATION**

17 Pursuant to Civil Local Rule 5-1(i)(3), regarding signatures, I hereby attest that  
18 concurrence in the filing of this document has been obtained from all signatories above.

19  
20 Dated: March 12, 2019

/s/ R. Matthew Wise  
R. MATTHEW WISE

21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

## CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

Case Name: **State of California, et al. v.** No. **3:18-cv-01865**  
**Wilbur L. Ross, et al.**

---

I hereby certify that on March 12, 2019, I electronically filed the following documents with the Clerk of the Court by using the CM/ECF system:

**[PROPOSED] FINAL JUDGMENT, ORDER OF VACATUR, AND PERMANENT INJUNCTION**

I certify that **all** participants in the case are registered CM/ECF users and that service will be accomplished by the CM/ECF system.

I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the State of California the foregoing is true and correct and that this declaration was executed on March 12, 2019, at Sacramento, California.

Tracie L. Campbell

---

Declarant

/s/ *Tracie Campbell*

---

Signature